

**MINISTRY OF EDUCATION
AND TRAINING**

MINISTRY OF FINANCE

ACADEMY OF FINANCE

LE THE TUYEN

**FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT
OF PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES UNDER
THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE**

Academic major: Finance - Banking

Reference code : 9.34.02.01

THESIS SUMMARY

HANOI, 2020

This thesis has been accomplished at: **ACADEMY OF FINANCE**

Instructor: **Assoc. Prof., Dr. Tran Xuan Hai**

Paper Reviewer 1:

.....

Paper Reviewer 2:

.....

Paper Reviewer 3:

.....

The thesis has been successfully presented and reviewed at the
Doctorate Examination Council of Academy of Finance at
dated

- The thesis can be referenced at:**
- The National Library.
 - The Library of Academy of Finance.

INTRODUCTION

1. Background

The education system of Vietnam including public higher education is on the way to position its brand in the region and in the world. However, the reform process has been rather slow in terms of both institutional and organizational aspects reflecting in small training size and performance that not meeting the demand of the society, inadequate organization structure, lack of autonomy and social responsibilities, inflexible training programs, sluggish integration, backward teaching and learning methods, underdeveloped infrastructure, etc. One of the most important factor affecting the training quality of the public universities in Vietnam is the financial management mechanism.

In Vietnam, although there are few public universities under the Ministry of Finance, the management mechanism (operation), the degree of financial autonomy are diversified and highly socialized. As a result, the pressure of competition is absolute high. Therefore, conducting the thesis “Financial management of public universities under the Ministry of Finance” is assessed important in both literature and reality aspects.

2. Research objectives and study tasks

2.1. Research objectives

On the basis of a summary of the theoretical matters regarding financial management mechanism of the public universities; the research analyzes and clarifies the practical financial management mechanism of the public universities under Ministry of Finance; on the basis of the findings, the author recommends the solutions to enhancing the financial management process for the public universities under Ministry of Finance and public universities in Vietnam in general.

2.2. Study tasks

In order to achieve the research objectives, the author plans to conduct study tasks namely:

First, summarize and clarify the literature of higher education and financial management, public higher education and financial management; role and importance (or the system of rights and benefits) of participants who take part in financial management of public universities; global experience in financial management for public universities and lessons for Vietnam; local practice and lessons for Ministry of Finance.

Second, analyze and assess the practical financial management of public universities under Ministry of Finance in the period 2013-2018 to point out achievements and limitation as well as the causes.

Third, propose solutions to enhancing performance of financial management of public universities under Ministry of Finance and public universities in Vietnam.

3. Research subjects and methodology

3.1. Research subjects

- Research entities: Ministry of Finance (agency, the unit of estimation level I) and the public universities (including universities, academies - the units of estimation using state budget) under Ministry of Finance.

- Research subjects: the literature and practice of financial management of the public universities.

3.2. Scope of research

- The contents: Financial management activities of the public universities and universities under Ministry of Finance in particular should be conducted in different contents and with participation of the stakeholders: the government, universities, other social stakeholders (learners, learners' families, enterprises, etc). However, due to the limited time and practical conditions to ensure a thorough study, this thesis will focus partly on financial management contents namely (i) management of financial resource mobilization; (ii) management of financial resource allocation and utilization; (iii) financial control; and (iv) organization and operation of a financial management mechanism. The study on financial management mechanism of the public universities under Ministry of Finance, as a result, will be conducted at the aspects of (1) legal documents (mechanism, regulations), and (2) the process that Ministry of Finance and public universities administer these documents (management mechanism).

- The context: The thesis investigates the financial management mechanisms of the public universities under Ministry of Finance including four universities: Academy of Finance, University of Finance and Business Administration, University of Finance and Accounting, University of Finance and Marketing.

- The time: The research focus on the period 2013-2018, this is the period that reflected definitely (i) the adjustments of autonomy of the public administration units (including the public universities) together with the enforcement of Decree 16/2015/NĐ-CP, and (ii) the adaptation of ministry (the agency) and the universities to the Decree 16/2015/NĐ-CP. However, during the research process, the data of previous periods were also employed to clarify the historic aspects. For instance, from Sept 2017, the Finance - Customs College was merged into the University of Finance and Marketing, but to ensure the rationale of the research data, the thesis employed the financial data and figures of the Finance - Customs College for the period 2013-2017. The time for the measures and recommendations is from present until 2025 and with prospect to 2030.

3.3. Research methodology

- Overall methodology:

The author uses the methodologies of dialectical materialism and historical materialism to do the research and ensure the comprehensiveness, consistency, rationale and reality (specific events); and to ensure thoroughly the views of Party and State on reforming organization and management mechanism, improving quality and performance of the public administration units.

- Specific methodology:

+ Qualitative methodology (with major methodologies and approaches such as: documentary summary and literary concept; statistics; analysis; comparison; logic deduction) which are used to define specific contents related to the research topic; literary summarizing to identify the factors and to recommend concepts of financial management of the public universities; describing to assess the practical financial management activities of the public universities under Ministry of Finance; investigating global and local experience; recommending views, principles and solutions of financial management for the public universities under Ministry of Finance in the future.

+ Quantitative methodology (with major methodologies and approaches such as descriptive and deductive statistics) is used to collect data, describe and present data sheets, diagrams, calculations and speculation of indicators (absolute or relative) to give evidence and evaluation of financial management of the public universities under Ministry of

Finance; recommending the degree of financial autonomy and the tendencies of payable structure for these universities in the coming time.

4. Overview

The system of published books, monographs; previous studies published on journals, magazines and seminars,... regarding financial management, financial autonomy and financial management mechanism for public universities is rich in number and sources and with different views, approaches and evaluations. These are valuable material sources for the author. Through an overall evaluation of such studies, and in addition to the results inherited by the author, there are also unsolved issues and study gaps such as:

First, the previous studies mostly focus on financial management mechanism of the public universities on the perspective of macroeconomic management of the Government, or on the perspective of internal management of a specific university but not on the perspective of the financial management mechanism of the public universities with the interaction between agency and affiliated universities to have an insight to the practical operation of the financial mechanism, financial autonomy of the public universities in Vietnam.

Second, financial management of the public university has to conclude different management activities which have been investigated in previous studies according to different views and approaches but there have been no studies on the organization and operation of the financial management mechanism as a content of management or a channel to ensure the performance of financial management mechanism and financial autonomy of the public university in reality.

Third, there have been some studies on the financial management mechanism of the public agencies and public administration units, but there have been no studies on the financial management of the public universities under Ministry of Finance conducted to ensure the performance of financial management of these universities.

Therefore, the research topic “Financial management of the public universities under Ministry of Finance” is considered essential by the author and not overlapped any other previous studies.

5. Scientific and practical significance of the thesis

On the theoretical aspect, the author has summarized, analyzed and developed the previous studies to identify the fundamentals of higher education, public higher education, financial management and financial management mechanism of the public universities; role and position (or the system of rights and benefits) of the participants taking part in the financial management activities of the public universities; global experience and lesson for Vietnam, local experience and lesson for the Ministry of Finance.

On the practical aspect, the author has thoroughly analyzed and evaluated the financial management practice of the public universities under Ministry of Finance during the period 2013-2018 on the perspective of agency and affiliated universities (the participants who taking part in operating the financial mechanism). Thereby, the author defines the achieved results and limitations of the financial management process of these universities as well as the causes. These are the important arguments provided by the author with attempt to propose a system of views, principles and solutions to enhance the performance of financial management mechanism for the public universities under Ministry of Finance in the years to come.

6. Structure of the thesis

In addition to the introduction, references and index, the thesis composes of three main chapters:

Chapter 1. Literature on financial management of the public universities.

Chapter 2. Practical financial management of the public universities under Ministry of Finance.

Chapter 3. Solutions to enhance the performance of financial management of the public universities under Ministry of Finance.

Chapter 1

LITERATURE ON FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT OF PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES

1.1. OVERVIEW ON PUBLIC HIGHER EDUCATION

1.1.1. Higher education and the role of higher education in sustainable development

1.1.1.1. Higher education

Higher education is a form of education levels after the high school level, they are optional with training levels including undergraduate, master and doctor levels. The basic difference between general education and higher education is that: high school education offers basic knowledge and qualities for citizens, while higher education trains human resources with creative capacity even when in the learning process.

1.1.1.2. The role of higher education in sustainable development

Higher education plays an important role in sustainable of every country. This role is determined by means of the relationship/interaction between higher education and three major contents of sustainable development namely:

First, higher education in economic development (sustainable economy)

Second, higher education in ensuring social equality and human development (sustainable society)

Third, higher education in exploiting and using effectively the natural resources, constantly protecting and improving the living environment (sustainable environment)

1.1.2. Public university and classification of public universities

1.1.2.1. Public university

Public university is a public administration unit functions in the field of higher education.

1.1.2.2. Classification of public universities

The system of public universities in Vietnam currently can be classified according to different criteria depending on goals/requirements of management:

- Level of higher education
- Field of study
- Degree of financial autonomy
- Governing agency

Public universities founded and funded by the Government, thus the classification of public universities is determined by the Government to meet the goals/requirements of the state for each period.

1.2. FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT OF PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES

1.2.1. The concept of financial management of public universities

Financial management of public universities is the interaction between state, universities and other social stakeholders (learners, learners' families, enterprises, etc.) on the basis of mutual rights and benefits and is reflected in a rational use of tools and management approaches (by levels of authority) to impact and control the appropriation, allocation and use of financial resources to enhance the financial management performance of public universities to meet the social demands.

However, within the scope of research and to ensure the thoroughness of the research, the author focuses on analyzing the financial management process of public universities in the relationship with the state (governing agency).

1.2.2. The role of financial management in public universities

Financial management is essential to the comprehensive development of the public universities in both size and quality aspects.

However, financial management itself if not identified and operated effectively may lead to negative effects. Therefore, the requirements for financial management mechanism of public universities must ensure following principles: (1) concentration and democracy, (2) publicity and transparency, and (3) accountability of the participants.

1.2.3. Contents of financial management of public universities

1.2.3.1. Management of financial resource mobilization

The contents of financial resource funding for the public universities by channels can be summarized as following:

State budget funding

Dependent on size and efficiency of state budget as well as the orientation and objectives of higher education development by periods of the country, the degree of support funded by state budget may vary in one of following models:

Group 1: Not funded by the state budget

Group 2: Funded by the state budget in capital construction and development, operation expenditure is not included

Group 3: Funded by the state budget in capital construction and development, operation expenditure is partly included

Group 4: Entirely funded by the state budget

Therefore, the support using state budget is considered an powerful instrument helping the Government control and modify the higher education system and public higher education system in particular. As stated by Vught (1993), power offered to person who pays. The government funds and allocates state budget in different ways, and the allocation approach significantly impacts the way public universities use the state budget. This is a rather complicated process which may cause debates when the demand is usually excessive while the support/fund is limited.

The Bikas C. Sanyal and WB studies show the general trend of the shift in the way the state provides funding for public universities from input-based (management by inputs) to input-based (management by output and performance results) method. This shift is a manifestation of the change in the relationship between public universities and governing agencies in the way of strengthening, promoting autonomy and self-responsibility of public universities, and it follows the laws of market economy but not administrative power/command. In Vietnam, the content of state budget management by output/task performance is specified in Clause 15, Article 25 of the State Budget Law, Article 11 of Decree No. 163/2016/NĐ-CP.

Non-state budget funding

Depending on the specific condition of each country, in certain periods, non-state budget mobilized to invest/fund public universities may have different mechanisms, and often includes: revenue/contribution from learners (tuition fee); revenues from training and cooperation, scientific research, production, business and service; grants, aids, gifts, donations from domestic and foreign individuals or organizations; investment of domestic and foreign investors; other lawful revenue sources as prescribed by laws. Raising non-state financial resources to finance/invest in public universities is a popular measure in global countries contributing to reducing the burden on the state budget and solving the problem of expansive demand, improved quality of training and scientific research of universities in the context of globalization, intensive international integration and competition today.

Management of non-state financial resources for public universities has been examined in following contents:

(1) *Tuition fees*

(2) *Other receivables (non-tuition fees)*

Non-state budget financing is also an integral part of public university funding. Therefore, it is common practice to mobilize non-state financial resources to follow certain principles. Adherence to these principles is intended to adequately manage and promote the efficient allocation and use of resources by public universities. According to Le Xuan Truong et al, there are 04 principles set out for managing non-state financial sources:

Law compliance

Adequacy, transparency of the non-state budget revenues

Centralization and unity of non-state budget revenues

Compulsory tax duties toward state budget

1.2.3.2. Management of allocation and use of financial resources

The central objective of management of allocation and use of financial resources is to ensure efficient use, or in other words, management of allocation and use of financial resources must help entities (state, universities) “shift” resources flexibly between activities (financial allocation function) to adapt quickly to environmental changes and to achieve the set goals.

For the state (governing body), management of allocation and use of financial resources for investment/funding for public universities may be considered according to the funding sources associated with the decision-making authority of the state (investor/sponsor), and by nature of expenditures /contents (development and recurrent expenditure). But in nature, it is a manifestation of the university’s autonomy (including financial autonomy) which is applied by the state to administer the system of public universities.

For public universities, the management of allocation and use of financial resources to fund their affiliated units are similar to regimes that the state (governing body) applies to fund public universities as described above, but with a narrower scale/scope. And in nature, it is also an expression of the financial autonomy within schools (through the process, decentralized authority stipulated in the regulation of internal spending of public universities).

1.2.3.3. Financial control

Financial control of public universities is a comprehensive set of management tools and approaches established by entities involved in operating the mechanism (state and university) to oversee and monitor activities of creating, allocating and using financial resources to timely make appropriate interventions and adjustments and to ensure the effectiveness and sustainability of financial autonomy process of public universities. This is a specific activity conducted by the state authority with the support of financial instruments and financial assessment mechanisms set up by the state agencies to clarify accountability and effectiveness of financial activities conducted by the public universities. In terms of system administration, the financial activities of public universities are also controlled by the universities themselves, through the establishment of internal regulations, processes and internal decentralization ... in consistency with the mechanism regulated by the state. The extent of financial control of public universities depends largely on the financial autonomy of public universities themselves.

1.2.3.4. Organization and performance of financial management mechanism

A management mechanism is a set of divisions, modules and individuals with certain responsibilities and powers which is arranged, assigned and scientifically decentralized to coordinate the implementation of management functions (may be considered according to the management process including: planning, organizing, operating, inspecting; or dividing by management fields such as finance, human resources, research and development ...) in order to achieve goals for each period. Each management apparatus has its own operating submechanism which includes the basic principles and relationships identified to ensure the effective coordination of the modules, divisions and individuals.

The basic principles of organizational structure management are: (i) principle of specialization and assignment of functions; (ii) principle of management scope assignment and management decentralization; (iii) principle of unity and completion; (iv) principle of compatibility between functions, duties and powers and between powers, duties and means; (v) principle of effectiveness and efficiency.

The process of building a management mechanism in general and a financial management apparatus in particular is carried out in the following main stages: (1) defining the objectives, functions, management tasks and general structure of the apparatus; (2) assigning functions and tasks to establish management divisions and modules; (3) defining the powers, responsibilities and means of operation for divisions and individuals and formulate operational regulations; (4) developing regulations to coordinate activities between divisions and modules within the organization and between the organization and external organizations. This is an important basis for reviewing and improving the organization and operation of the financial management mechanism of public universities.

1.2.4. Criteria to evaluate the financial management process of public universities

Criteria to evaluate the financial management process of public universities are the standards and measures (to ensure the rational and realistic manner) to identify the economy, effectiveness and efficiency of the financial management activities of public universities.

Within the scope of research, the criteria to evaluate the financial management process of public universities include:

First, criteria of financial resources to ensure the achievement of training and research goals

Second, criteria of financial planning and management according to the principles of compliance, transparency and publicity

Third, criteria to evaluate the use of financial resources and the compliance with the financial inspection, supervision and auditing regimes.

1.2.5. Factors affecting the financial management process of public universities

1.2.5.1. Macro factors

Social and economic institution

Social and economic development level

International integration trend and the Industry 4.0

1.2.5.2. Micro factors

Development strategy of the public universities

Scale and organizational structure of the public universities

Management competence and prestige of the public universities

Management capacity of the governing body and the public universities

1.3. EXPERIENCE IN FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT OF PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES AND THE LESSON

1.3.1. Global experience and lesson for Vietnam

1.3.1.1. Global experience

Experience of China

Experience of France

Experience of the United States

1.3.1.2. Lesson for Vietnam

First, it is essential to define the public services provided by public administration units, public services provided by non-public units, and public services provided by the both entities. Then, we would be able to classify public administration units by their fields and types of service.

Second, identify the important role of the state in investing/supporting the development of basic and essential public services (such as education, healthcare, ...) and other public administration units in particular both in terms of mechanism and financial resources, but it is necessary to adjust the nature of the investment/support from the state budget in providing public services, which is needed to formulate and promulgate the economic-technical norms for every field of public sector.

Third, define evaluation criteria associated with the performance to evaluate the efficiency of output-based budget expenditures, of which the most important issue is to develop criteria and indicators to measure and evaluate results.

Fourth, improve the mechanism of inspecting, supervising and assessing the performance of public administration units at both internal and external aspects.

Fifth, the reform of public administration units in general and public universities in particular must be conducted deliberately by a roadmap and linked to administrative reform and characteristics of the socio-economic development.

Sixth, improve the quality of human resources, promote the application of information technology and build a centralized database system for financial management of public administration units.

1.3.2. Local practice and lesson for Ministry of Finance

1.3.2.1. Local practice

Ministry of Trade and Industry

Ministry of Education and Training

1.3.2.2. Lesson for Ministry of Finance

First, pay attention to innovating and improving the system documents and guidelines, specifying the mechanisms and policies on financial autonomy for public universities.

Second, the process of financial autonomy requires the entities (governing bodies and affiliated public universities) to: (i) constantly improve organizational structure, staff capacity to provide advisory in strategies and development plans with financial estimations for medium and long term; (ii) focus on inspection and supervision, especially the self-inspection and self-supervision of universities (this is considered an important criterion of financial autonomy).

Chapter 2

PRACTICAL FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT OF THE PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES UNDER MINISTRY OF FINANCE

2.1. OVERVIEW OF PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES UNDER MINISTRY OF FINANCE

2.1.1. Establishment, development and basic characteristics

2.1.1.1. *Establishment and development*

2.1.1.2. *Basic characteristics*

First, public universities in Vietnam normally have a very long history of foundation and development.

Second, public universities are usually consolidated and upgraded along the history of the national finance, they are also associated with the reality and development trend of the national education system and currently are compliant with regulations.

Third, they are under the direct management of the Ministry of Finance (governing body/unit of budget estimation level I); state management of the Ministry of Education and Training; administrative management of the People's Committee of Quang Ngai province (for the University of Finance and Accounting) and the People's Committee of Hung Yen province (for the University of Finance - Business Administration).

Fourth, levels, fields of training and research and international cooperation activities are diversified,... and are distributed widely in the North, Central and the South.

Fifth, public universities under the Ministry of Finance are currently classified, in terms of financial autonomy, into 02 groups: self-supported universities for all recurrent expenditures and investments; self-supported universities for part of their recurrent expenditures.

Sixth, according to the budget management decentralization mechanism, public universities under the Ministry of Finance (governing agency/units of budget estimation level I) including affiliated budget estimating units (level II) and budget-funded units (level III) under the budget estimation units level I.

2.1.2. Goals, majors, fields of study and training scale

2.1.2.1. *Training goals*

Training and providing qualified human resources with fair political and ethical qualities, knowledge and practical capacity in financial, economic and marketing management, ... relevant to training levels and increasing socio-economic development demands of the country and ability to cooperate in professional activities.

2.1.2.2. *Majors, fields of study and training scale*

2.2. PRACTICE OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT OF THE PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES UNDER MINISTRY OF FINANCE

2.2.1. Practice of financial resource mobilization

The scale of financial resources mobilized for the public universities under Ministry of Finance in the period 2013-2018 increases gradually over the years, but the growth rate is uneven and sporadic showing the low sustainability in financial mobilization. The average structure of the state budget accounted for 25.6%, tuition fees accounted for 57%, and other revenues and services accounted for 17.4% of the total financial resources, in which: tuition fees increase more stably than the state budget-funded sources. In addition, the revenues are determined by the "ask - offer" mechanism while the other revenues from public services have not been accessed.

2.2.1.1. State budget fund

Based on the State Budget Law, the Law on Public Investment and its guidelines, the state budget is granted to public universities under the Ministry of Finance according to 02 packages: Investment and Development and recurrent expenditure.

The management of financial sources funded by the state budget /invested for public universities under the Ministry of Finance is demonstrated through the process of 3-year state budget in financial planning and expenditure estimation. Annual state budget as prescribed in Article 18 of Circular No. 69/2017/TT-BTC, Article 11 of Circular No. 342/2016/TT-BTC, and instructions of the Ministry of Finance (managing agencies/estimating units level I) in Official Letter No. 4890/BTC-KHTC.

With the above mechanism for managing and mobilizing the financial sources from the State budget, in the period of 2013-2018, public universities under the Ministry of Finance have been supported by the Ministry of Finance (governing agencies/units of estimating level I) to improve training performance - an important premise to accelerate the process of implementing sustainable financial autonomy.

2.2.1.2. Non-state budget funds

Tuition fee

In the period from 2006 to present, the management of tuition fees at public universities and public universities under the Ministry of Finance in particular has been governed primarily by the legal documents: (i) regulations on autonomy of public administration units, and (ii) collection and use of tuition fee for institutions of the national education system.

In fact, in the period of 2013-2018, public universities under the Ministry of Finance have made great efforts to improve training quality and enrollment in order to mobilize resources from tuition fees and have achieved certain results:

- Tuition fee is still the major source of revenue in the total financial resources of the schools.
- Tuition fees of schools are increasing over the years.
- The pilot mechanism under Resolution No. 77/NQ-CP at the University of Finance and Marketing has obtained positive results.

Other revenues (non-tuition fee revenues)

In the period from 2006 to present, the management of non-tuition revenues (from services and other activities) at public universities and affiliated universities of the Ministry of Finance in particular complies with Decree No. 43/2006/NĐ-CP, Decree No. 16/2015/NĐ-CP and Resolution No. 77/NQ-CP.

In fact, in the period of 2013-2018, public universities under the Ministry of Finance have made great efforts to expand and improve the quality of non-tuition services (cooperative training; short courses in training and capacity building; publishing; canteen services, accommodation, parking lots; rooms and space...) in order to raise funds and support the training activities. Although the contribution of service activities (non-tuition revenues) is limited which only accounts for 17.4% of the total financial resources of the schools, there has been a significant increase in the period 2013-2018, from 83,967 million VND in 2013 to 139,190 million VND in 2018 equivalent to about 1.7 times, of which the Academy of Finance and the University of Finance and Marketing are still two largest training institutions with brands and advantages of training scale and location accounting for more than 83% of total service revenues (if including the Finance - Customs College after merging with the University of Finance - Marketing, this rate is about 90%).

However, in addition to the above-mentioned “traditional” services, the income from scientific research activities and transfer of research results; liquidation of assets; other revenues such as grants, aids, gifts, donations from domestic and foreign individuals and organizations are very limited.

Public universities under the Ministry of Finance in particular do not raise fund to support their activities.

2.2.2. Practice of financial resources allocation

2.2.2.1. *The allocation of resources*

The allocation of annual state budget to support affiliated universities must comply with the provisions of the State Budget Law, the Law on Public Investment, relevant instruction documents and decentralization of authority of the Ministry of Finance (governing body/units of budget estimation level I).

2.2.2.2. *The use of resources*

(1) For the budget-funded spending estimate:

The appropriation criteria must be ensured in accordance with the provisions of the State Budget Law which are defined as: only implement the items included in the budget estimate; have been approved by the head of the budget-using unit, investor or authorized person, and meet the specific criteria.

(2) For the tuition fee-funded spending estimate:

Based on the drafted budget estimates approved by the Ministry of Finance (governing agency/units of budget estimation level I), the universities are authorized to manage and use financial resources according to the mechanism applied to public administration units for a certain period, and the internal spending regulations.

Particularly for the University of Finance and Marketing, from the 2016 budget year, the Ministry of Finance (governing agency/unit of budget estimation level I) allocated/assigned the annual non-recurrent expenditures using the tuition fee according to the total estimate (non-allocation/assignment by details). The detailed allocation of non-recurrent spending estimate is under authority of the school and ensures the limit of total non-recurrent spending estimate assigned by the governing agency/unit of budget estimation level I.

Therefore, in terms of the procedure and authority of allocation for public universities under the Ministry of Finance must comply with the provisions of the State Budget Law and instruction documents in which the allocation and assignment of budget estimates are decided by the Ministry of Finance (governing agency/unit of budget estimation level I) and follow the mode of “state control” and are gradually switching to “output state control”, or “output-based budget allocation” but the move is slow and not definite.

Although the state budget allocation arranged for universities in the period of 2013-2018 appeared to decrease, it was slight rate for 06 years which partly reflected the implementation process and promotion of financial autonomy of public universities under the Ministry of Finance is still slow in comparison with the goals set out. Non-recurrent expenditure did not clearly show the trend of movement partly due to the nature of themselves, but looking at the details of the non-recurrent spending activities, most of the spendings were on facilities purchase (IT applications; procurement and repair of assets) accounting for 62.5% and showing the shortage of facilities and equipments of the schools. Therefore, public universities under the Ministry of Finance need to be additionally invested in order to ensure and improve the training and research performance.

Similar to the state budget expenditure estimates, in the 2013-2018 period, the operating estimates from the service revenues of public universities under the Ministry of Finance were mainly allocated to ensure the operational activities with an average proportion of 77.7%, thus the revenue of services allocated for non-recurrent activities remained modest with an average proportion of 22.3% (in which: spending on facilities accounted for 56.3%, spending on professional operation, scientific research, international cooperation and other non-recurrent activities accounted for 43.7% which again showed the difficulty in facilities and equipments of the schools).

Regarding the use of financial resources, consolidated data on revenue and expenditure of service activities shows that in the period of 2013-2018 public universities under the Ministry of Finance: (i) on one hand, strengthened the efficiency of revenue from service activities (from VND 423,344 million in 2013 to VND 648,550 million in 2018, equivalent to an increase of over 1.5 times), (ii) on the other hand, thoroughly managed spendings in the way to keep revenue growth higher than spending growth, thereby saving funds to ensure operations, modernize facilities and set funds according to the regulations (total revenue from supplementary funds in 2013 was 372,585 million VND and 523,071 million VND in 2017, equivalent to an increase of 1.4 times). In addition, public universities under the Ministry of Finance have also strictly complied with obligations to the state budget in accordance with tax law including: corporate income tax, value added tax, excise tax and personal income tax.

For the resources funded by the state budget (including revenues from service activities left to use and support funds), the settlement figures for the period of 2013-2018 show the certain limitation of financial resources of public universities under the Ministry of Finance, so they are mainly spent on recurrent activities, accounting for about 90% of the total cost (including: personal payment 50%; goods and services 28%; supports and supplements 1%; other expenses 11%), the proportion of resources spent on procurement, equipments and facilities remain low accounting for about 10% of the total settlement (including: 6% for assets; 4% for capital construction). However, due to the application of solutions to strictly manage spendings and to save recurrent costs to get additional resources for additional income and funds, thereby the amount of expenditure saving in 2013 was VND 101,601 million and increased to VND 153,878 million in 2018 (equivalent to an increase of about 1.5 times), an average of VND 131,906 million/year and accounting for about 23% of the total funding settlement. So, if we do not include the amount of expenditure to determine the saving expenditure (to supplement the income and set up funds), the average ratio of recurrent activities of universities is about 67% (= 90% - 23%); spending on procurement, equipment and facilities (including resources through the formation and use of the non-business fund) is around 15%; supplementing income, reward, welfare and reserve funds are about 18% of total settlement budget. Especially in this period, in addition to proactively balancing resources to ensure funding needs to implement the salary reform policy (wage increase) according to the general roadmap of the State, the source of additional funds of public universities under the Ministry of Finance also has a remarkable improvement. While the average minimum wage increased 114.1% from 1.1 million in 2013 to 1,345 million, the total settlement of other individual payments (mainly for income supplement) increased by 183.8%, from VND 54,293 million in 2013 to VND 99,817 million in 2018. Thereby, during the period of 2013-2018, the schools maintained additional income for their employees at the rate of 0.87 times of the salary, position and seniority allowances in excess of the framework prescribed by the state, specifically: 2013

0.69 times in 2013, 0.89 in 2014, 0.85 in 2015, 0.88 in 2016, 2017 and 2018 was 0.94. But if we compare the supplementary income with the average salary, wages and allowances (except allowances/night -shift/part-time), the coefficient (times) of annual supplementary income of schools is reduced by about 20% compared to the above-mentioned statistics, showing the existence of other salary-based allowances (according to the author's calculation based on the budget settlement data for the period 2013-2018 of public universities under the Ministry of Finance, and excluding night-shift allowances/part-time payments, the average rate of allowances accounts for about 25% of the total funds) which leads to the issuance of Resolution No. 27-NQ/TW dated 19/5/2018 of the Seventh Meeting of the Central Executive Committee XII on reforming wage and salary policies for state officials.

2.2.3. Practice of financial control

First, in terms of state management, the Ministry of Finance (governing agency/unit of budget estimation level I), through the Department of Planning and Finance [28], functions the financial control for the universities by the following mechanisms:

- Regular and indirect control
- Direct control

Second, from the perspective of internal governance, the universities build system of regulations and procedures to implement directly effective internal control of financial activities by means of internal spending regulations.

In the period of 2013-2018, the Ministry of Finance (governing agency/unit of budget estimation level I) and the public universities under the Ministry of Finance organize and control the internal financial management which is accredited by the State Audit Office of Vietnam through the 2015 financial report audits.

2.2.4. Practice of organization and operation of financial management mechanism

With the function performing both state and branch management (governing agency/unit of budget estimation level I) in budget and finance for affiliated units, the organizational structure of financial management for public universities under the Ministry of Finance is organized according to the current budget management decentralization and associated with the organizational structure of the Ministry of Finance, specifically:

2.2.4.1. For the Ministry of Finance

The Ministry of Finance (governing agency) with the role of an estimation unit level I according to the State Budget Law will manage the finance resources, assets, development investment, construction, internal inspection and auditing in affiliated units through: (i) developing and promulgating a system of decentralized regulations, authorization of financial management, public assets, construction investment, application of IT and internal audit in budget units under the Ministry; (ii) specifying the mechanisms, policies, regimes and norms promulgated by competent agencies in finance sector to apply consistently throughout financial sector; (iii) organizing structure, defining functions, tasks and powers of the Department of Planning and Finance.

In addition, as a Government agency, the Ministry of Finance performs the function of state management in finance - budget and organizational structure, there is also the Department of Finance and Administration which gives advice and assists the Minister to perform tasks of state management of finance (except for the security and defense sector).

2.2.4.2. For the public universities under the Ministry of Finance

As the budget units in accordance with the State Budget Law and decentralization mechanism of the Ministry of Finance, public universities under the Ministry of Finance are authorized to perform internal financial management through organizing and defining the functions, tasks and powers of their financial divisions, all of these division have following similar characteristics: (i) functioning finance and budget management (giving advisory to the Director/Principal on financial and accounting management according to the current regulations of the State and the Ministry of Finance, with a number of specific tasks such as advising and issuing internal guidelines on mechanisms, policies, professional processes related to financial and accounting management; making 3-year state budget and financial plans, annual state budget revenues and expenditures, implementing the estimates, preparing annual financial and budget settlement reports as prescribed; organizing and performing accounting work according to the provisions of the Accounting Law and instruction documents; performing financial inspection and financial disclosure;...); (ii) fully performing the functions of an accounting unit in accordance with the Accounting Law.

2.3. EVALUATING THE PRACTICE OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT OF PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES UNDER THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE

2.3.1. The achieved results

First, in terms of financial resource mobilization management

- The state budget for other non-recurrent spending accounts for a high proportion in the total state budget estimation for annual recurrent expenditure of the universities; the classification of financial autonomy of universities is not really effective and practical which may foster the “ask-give” mechanism in allocating the non-current expenditure, or the “ask-give” mechanism in building, classifying the autonomy degree . This TX, or “ask - give” in construction and evaluating the level of financial autonomy within the universities.

- The revenues of the schools are still dependent on the regular tuition fee, while revenue from other services is very limited showing the low financial sustainability.

- The public universities do not expanded service activities as they are dependent on the state budget (usually with stability and less volatility during the period of autonomy classification) resulting in less motivation to improve service quality to adapt to the new requirements of the market competition.

- The facilities of public universities under the Ministry of Finance are low and not relevant to the training scale and most of them are in the stage of construction and expansion; no unit has ever mobilized loans to implement construction projects or use them for service activities.

Second, in terms of allocation and use of financial resources

- The mechanism for allocating and using state budget to support the operation of universities is implemented according to the input- and staff-base but not linking to the outputs; investment resources are still scattered and not associated with the size and quality of products and services provided. Evaluation criteria for the results with the autonomy performance and self-responsibility are not available, or available but not specific (so it is important to differ “spending” from “cost” in the financial management mechanism of public universities). The economic-technical norms are insufficient so it is difficult to determine the unit price of orders, bidding as well as implementation.

- The fact that the Ministry of Finance announces the inspection number and assigns the revenue and expenditure estimates using the tuition fee to the affiliated universities, on one hand, impacts positively on the financial compliance of both universities and the governing body, but on the other hand, this regulation also creates inadequacies in practice

such as unnecessary procedures that reduce the effectiveness and efficiency of financial management.

- The management and operation mechanism of the universities have not been renovated leading to the low quality and effectiveness of training and scientific research. needs of the society. The internal spending regulations have been developed and regularly revised to meet the practical operation of the unit, but there are also insufficient or incomplete contents and spendings.

Third, in terms of financial control

- The internal accounting and auditing activities of the Ministry of Finance applied to affiliated universities mainly focus on the compliance with regulations and management procedures but not on operational control and efficiency in using financial resources, so the recommendations were limited and not fully promoted the functions of internal audit in supporting universities to improve their “self-control”, an important premise to ensure and accelerate the process of financial autonomy of universities.

- Measures and sanctions for the shortcomings and limitations in the financial management of universities are not adequate together with the loose implementation of these measures and sanctions leading to reduced effectiveness of financial control.

- Monitoring, supervision and inspection system currently focuses mainly on financial accounting, so only monitoring function has been implemented; staff capacity in planning and finance is limited, so there is no comprehensive advice on medium/long-term plans, as well as specific policies for institution leaders in mobilizing effective and sustainable financial resources.

- Regulations on internal inspection and auditing of financial management, accounting, state assets, construction and information technology application in administrative agencies and public service agencies under the Ministry of Finance has been released since 2012, but it has been irregularly reviewed and amended to ensure the compliance with updated laws, especially Decree No. 05/2019/NĐ-CP dated 22nd January 2019 of the Government.

Fourth, the organization and operation of the financial management mechanism at the Ministry of Finance (the governing body) and at the affiliated public universities are still complicated in terms of process and content, especially when the level of IT application in management and financial management is not consistent. The interconnection between levels, functional departments of the governing body and the universities is not ensure that creates the “information gaps” in administering and directing the management tasks.

2.3.3. The causes

The above mentioned limitations and shortcomings have objective reasons. However, according to the author and within the scope of research, subjective causes are still predominant both from the governing body and from public universities as follows:

First, the institutionalization of the Party’s guidelines into policies and laws of the State on the public sector and higher education in particular, especially the regulations on financial management is slow, inadequate, incomplete and not keeping up with the socio-economic development of the country. A number of mechanisms and policies on autonomy and financial autonomy have been issued but practical implementation still faces many difficulties.

Second, Decree No. 16/2015/NĐ-CP was issued in early 2015 but not really come into life, so from 2015 the Ministry of Finance and affiliated universities continued to implement the former regulations of the Decree No. 43/2006/NĐ-CP.

Third, the ministries and sectors are not active and decisive to build and apply the mechanisms and policies of their sectors to realize the public administration reform according to Conclusion 37-TB/TW dated 26/5/2011 of the Poliburo.

Fourth, mechanisms and policies on financial autonomy are insufficient and incomplete; the classification of financial autonomy is mainly based on the self-support of recurrent expenditures but not on the professional capacity and initial advantages that the state has invested in public universities; criteria to evaluate the effectiveness and quality of operations of the universities in providing public services are insufficient and incomplete, so there are many inadequacies during implementation and the autonomy process takes place slowly.

Fifth, the assignment of full autonomy for the public universities usually has two opposite sides, so without a relevant control mechanism with fair publicity and transparency it may cause “arbitrariness and authoritarian” from the unit leaders, meanwhile the performance of academic councils is still formal and not promoting their role and responsibilities.

Sixth, the method of allocating state budget to support public universities is slow and irregularly renewed, and it is a form of egalitarianism with “negotiation”, “input-based allocation” without criteria for binding the use of state budget with the quantity and quality of assigned public service tasks.

Seventh, revenues of the public universities under Ministry of Finance are dependent on regular tuition fee. In addition, the location of universities also affects student’s psychology when they submit enrollment application.

Eighth, the financial-accounting data system is still scattered, so the analysis and evaluation of financial performance of the governing body are very difficult and infrequent; The universities do not really pay attention to arranging, training and fostering human resources for the planning work as well as not having built an appropriate process to effectively coordinate the departments (Finance and Accounting, Facilities, Training, ...) in medium- and long-term budget planning; there has been no internal audit department operating independently from the finance and accounting departments.

Ninth, perception of the universities about operational reform demand in the way of autonomy, self-responsibility, self-balancing and self-supported of recurrent expenditures is still limited.

Chapter 3

SOLUTIONS TO ENHANCING FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PERFORMANCE OF PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES UNDER THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE

3.1. STRATEGIC GOALS, DEVELOPMENT ORIENTATION OF PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES UNDER THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE BY 2030

Academy of Finance

University of Finance - Business Administration

University of Finance and Accounting

University of Finance and Marketing

3.2. CONCEPTION AND PRINCIPLES OF FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT OF PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES UNDER THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE

3.2.1. Conception

First, ensuring the leadership of the Party, the management of the State, the responsibilities of the unit leaders and the supervision of the people and society in order to promote social advancements and equality.

Second, (i) associating with the improvement of public financial management mechanism in Vietnam, and (ii) complying with socialism-oriented market economy, international integration and trends of the Industrial Revolution 4.0.

Third, enhancing the effectiveness and efficiency of the state management.

Fourth, strengthening the socialization of training and research services on the basis of effective application of market relationships.

3.2.2. Principles

First, timely motivating and mobilizing financial resources in the communities.

Second, moderating the linkage with public universities under the Ministry of Finance by means of financial relations.

Third, creating a favorable legal corridor for the inspection, monitoring of financial activities of public universities under the Ministry of Finance.

Fourth, encouraging and promoting the autonomy, self-responsibility of the public universities under the Ministry of Finance in forming, allocating and using effectively the financial resources funded directly by the state budget and non-state budget in the manner of sustainability.

Fifth, ensuring the financial resources that promote the performance of training and research of the universities.

Sixth, improving the compliance, publicity and transparency of the public universities.

Seventh, improving the financial management mechanism of the public universities under the Ministry of Finance in the manner of simplicity, effectiveness and efficiency.

Eighth, promoting the potentials of intellectual, innovation, initiative of the officials, lecturers and researchers of the universities.

3.3. SOLUTIONS TO ENHANCING FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT PERFORMANCE OF PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES UNDER THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE

3.3.1. Solutions to managing financial resource mobilization

First, quickly promote the reform process of financial management for the public universities under the Ministry of Finance.

To implement this measure, it is initially to investigate and specify the methods of forming, allocating budget estimations according to the outputs and associating with the results and performance of training and research activities of the schools.

Simultaneously, it is necessary to improve the system of budget allocation norms, regimes and expenditure standards applied to the public universities.

Second, the budgeting in the coming period needs to combine estimation allocation (methods of autonomy, norms, etc.) and order contracts with universities by means of bidding, competition in which the scientific research, training, capacity building and Laos student training program activities are the priority.

Third, the universities need to establish the PR division with participation of representatives from other departments under the direct management of the school management board, or authorize to a specific department under the schools such as International Relations Dept, Scientific Research Dept, etc. To make them the linking division in motivating other organizations and individuals to fund the research activities which have been approved by the Academic Councils.

Fourth, participate in research programs, projects funded by international and local sponsorship and aids, thereby improve the capacity of staffs and lecturers as well as improve revenue and position the brands. It is popular to promote revenues from research activities by means of ministry-level research agreements at National Institute for Finance.

Fifth, improve the regulations on revenue management. To achieve this goal, the public universities under the Ministry of Finance need to focus on: (i) expanding postgraduate programs, advanced training programs, international training programs; (ii) expanding and promoting the training and research quality; (iii) diversify the provided services, advisory and training supports, etc. to improve revenue; (iv) enhancing international financial resources.

Sixth, building projects using available assets from different funds and financial sources and submit for approval.

Adopting solutions to improve the above-mentioned financial management process, and in combination with the allocation, rational and efficient use of the available funds as presented in the item 3.3.2 below, the author supposes that in the period of 2018-2020, the level of recurrent expenditure self-support of public universities under the Ministry of Finance (except the University of Finance and Marketing who already has self-support mechanism) will be: 97% for Academy of Finance; 63% for University of Finance - Business Administration; 63% for University of Finance and Accounting, and it is expected in 2025: the Academy of Finance assures all recurrent expenses (and initially accumulates to support investment); University of Finance - Business Administration 75%; University of Finance - Accounting 70%.

3.3.2. Solutions to enhancing financial resource allocation and utilization

First, the annual and medium-term (3-to-5-year) financial planning of public universities under the Ministry of Finance should be used as an important management tool to coordinate, control and evaluate the practice as well as work out appropriate and feasible plans for the next period.

Second, innovating the method of funding allocation to increase the efficiency of management and use of funds through the restructuring of recurrent spending (personal payment and administrative management, spending on quality assurance factors) to make finance function the administration (overseeing management activities).

Third, removing unnecessary spending controls of public universities under the Ministry of Finance.

Fourth, building and improving a number of contracts and assigning financial autonomy to public universities under the Ministry of Finance on a large scale (Academy of Finance, University of Finance - Marketing).

Fifth, improving the internal spending regulations of public universities under the Ministry of Finance to adapt to the new operating mechanism and in association with the school's medium-term and long-term plans, avoiding subjective regulations development leading to the fact that many expenditures are made according to the "reverse process".

Sixth, building a centralized database system on finance - accounting and state budget of the Ministry of Finance (governing agencies/unit of budget estimation level I).

Seventh, formulating and promulgating economic-technical norms applied temporarily to undergraduate and postgraduate training courses of public universities under the Ministry of Finance.

3.3.3. Solutions of financial control

First, from the governing agency (Ministry of Finance)

(1) Develop a system of criteria and standards for inspecting and supervising financial activities of public administration units in general and public universities under the Ministry of Finance in particular.

Accordingly, first of all, the Ministry of Finance (governing agencies/unit of budget estimation level I) needs to examine and promulgate a system of financial activity analysis indicators for public universities under the Ministry of Finance, specifically:

Group 1. Indicators analyzing the situation of revenue exploitation/mobilization

Group 2. Indicators analyzing the situation of using financial resources

Group 3. Indicators analyzing financial performance

Through calculation and analysis of the above-mentioned indexes, it will give management levels the general situation of annual financial results of public universities under the Ministry of Finance, so as to promptly take solutions from both the revenue and expenditure aspects to meet the practical situation as well as current regulations of the State and the Ministry of Finance in the direction of: (i) strengthening the expansion of high quality activities/services, satisfying the demand of the labor market; (ii) strictly controlling expenditures, adjusting reasonable cost allocation among activities/services or departments in order to shift resources flexibly and efficiently.

(2) Review and renovate the report preparation process. Simultaneously, strongly apply IT in statistical reporting. Accordingly, the Ministry of Finance should have internal regulations on responsibilities for providing information of school reports via official emails, from which attaching responsibility of universities and supervisors as well as significantly reducing the amount of unnecessary administrative documents.

(3) Improve the quality of guidance, allocation appraisal, adjustment of budget estimates, final settlement of state budget revenues and expenditures of the professional division of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Planning - Finance).

Second, from the public universities under the Ministry of Finance

(1) Developing a mechanism to control the independent activities and autonomy to implement the responsibilities of the subjects.

(2) Conducting a regime of publicity for public universities according to the regulations of the state and the Ministry of Education and Training.

(3) Maintaining the fair implementation of the basic Democracy regulations; periodically receiving public comments and feedback throughout the school on the contents of the internal expenditure regulation to timely adjust and supplement as well as create a broad agreement among the lecturers, administrators and staffs.

(4) Performing financial self-inspection in accordance with state regulations (Decision No. 67/2004/QĐ-BTC dated August 13th 2004) and the regulation on internal inspection and audit of financial, accounting, state assets, construction and IT application management in administrative agencies and public service agencies under the Ministry of Finance.

(5) Strictly and fully following the periodical reporting, inspection, examination, approval, and report appraisal of the governing body and the relevant ministries or sectors as prescribed.

(6) Actively hiring an independent auditor or inviting the SAV to audit the annual financial statements, construction projects, procurement of equipment facilities.

(7) Paying attention to mobilize resources in facilities to collect and process information to support the school management and decision making.

3.3.4. Solutions of organizing and operating financial management mechanism

First, there is a need for a clear assignment of tasks, responsibilities of each department of finance, accounting, statistics, and internal auditing in the universities. Accordingly, it is advisable to reorganize the departments of finance and accounting (or planning and finance) into 3 separate divisions including: (1) the department of finance; (2) department of accounting; and (3) department of internal audit independent from the finance and accounting departments in accordance with the Decree No. 05/2019/NĐ-CP dated January 22nd 2019.

Second, improving the management accounting of public universities under the Ministry of Finance; applying IT in management, building a complete and reliable financial and accounting database system integrated with other existing management modules and software such as: training software; human resource planning...

Third, training to improve financial management capacity for units under the universities. When implementing the financial autonomy mechanism, financial management capacity building in accounting and finance work is a prerequisite to ensure effective and compliant financial activities.

Fourth, renovating and implementing the financial plans of the universities as these plans are basically the decisions of the management board on the goals, measures and assurances of facilities to achieve the goals for a certain period.

Fifth, establishing and applying the Balanced Scorecard (BCS) at public universities under the Ministry of Finance in order to promote the financial autonomy.

3.4. PREREQUISITES FOR THE SOLUTIONS

In order to ensure the consistent and effective implementation of the 04 groups of financial management solutions for public universities under the Ministry of Finance, a number of recommendations are made for the state (Government, Ministry of Education and Training and other ministries) namely:

First, amending and supplementing the Decree No. 16/2015/ND-CP to reform the management system and improve the operational performance of the public administration units.

Second, improving the policies on tuition fee on the basis of cost-sharing principle.

Third, improving the efficiency of state budget management for education and training.

Fourth, reviewing regulations on quality standards (university standards, training program standards, standards for establishment of major, standards for enrollment and training scale, standards for lecturers, managerial staffs and facilities, etc.), transparency and publicity of information on quality assurance, and actual training quality for (i) the higher education institutions, (ii) management authority, and (iii) learners to supervise training quality.

Fifth, applying regulations enforcing public administration units in general and public higher education institutions in particular to fulfill tax obligations to the state budget.

Sixth, strengthening innovation and improving the efficiency of university governance focusing on the capacity and power of the Academic Council in all higher education institutions.

Seventh, communicating information about university autonomy, and the accountability of higher education institutions throughout the society.

Eighth, instructing, inspecting, supervising and supporting higher education institutions to prepare for autonomy, publicity and transparency of information on quality assurance, addressing difficulties and problems during the autonomy process.

CONCLUSION

The autonomy of the public universities in general and public universities under the Ministry of Finance in particular includes (1) autonomy of conducting tasks and duties, (2) organization and human resource arrangement, (3) autonomy of finance. After a certain time of application, the autonomy model has achieved positive results in training and research relieving the burden of state budget in education and training sector. Accordingly, a number of public universities have exploited the diversified external financial resources to fund their activities, infrastructure and facility development, training and research improvement, application of IT and AI to the financial management process. However, in addition to the achievements, there are also limitations such as slow and unsustainable implementation of financial autonomy at the public universities which, in return, impact negatively on the assurance and improvement of training and research quality. Simultaneously, the use of financial resources of the public universities has not been as efficient as expectations due to the certain limitations and weaknesses. Therefore, the selection of research topic “**Financial management of public universities under the Ministry of Finance**” has both literary and realistic significance.

The research contents and research results have been focused on addressing following issues:

First, summarize and specify the literature of higher education, public higher education and financial management of public universities; the role and importance (or the system of rights and benefits) of the participants taking part in the financial management process of the public universities; global experience in financial management of public universities and lesson for Vietnam; local practice and lesson for the Ministry of Finance.

Second, the thesis analyzes and evaluates the practice of financial management of public universities under the Ministry of Finance in the period 2013-2018, thereby specifying the achieved results and limitations as well as causes.

Third, the thesis proposes solution to enhancing the performance of financial management of the public universities under the Ministry of Finance in particular and public universities in the coming years.

Financial management and financial management of the public universities in particular is a complicated issue. Within the scope of this research, study gaps and relevant inadequacies are inevitable in terms of contents and methodology. Therefore, the author expects to receive comments, reviews and feedback from scientists, researchers and other relevant agencies, organization and individuals for further study improvement./.

LIST OF PUBLISHED RESEARCHES

1. Le The Tuyen (2015), "*Policies on higher education tuition fee*", Journal of Financial and Accounting Study, Vol. 12 (149), page 6-8, Author.
2. Le The Tuyen (2015), "*Improving internal inspection and auditing performance on the use of expenditures and assets at the public administrative agencies and public non-business units*", Ministry-level project (Ministry of Finance), Scientific secretary.
3. Le The Tuyen (2016), "*State financial management of higher education institutions implementing financial autonomy*", Ministry-level project (Ministry of Finance), Member.
4. Le The Tuyen (2016), "*Global experience in renovating financial policies for public administrative units and lesson for Vietnam*", Workshop proceedings "Autonomy mechanism for the public administrative units of Quang Ninh province: Practice and Recommendations", Academy of Finance and People's Committee of Quang Ninh, page 195-202, Author.
5. Le The Tuyen (2016), "*Policy on public service cost management in healthcare and education sectors of Vietnam - Practice and Recommendations*", Workshop proceedings "Roadmap to transform fees and charges into costs in the context of market economy and socialization of public services", Nationak Insitute for Finance and University of Finance - Marketing, page 8-18, Co-author.
6. Le The Tuyen (2017), "*Renovating operation of public administrative units under the Ministry of Finance*", Ministry-level project (Ministry of Finance), Member.
7. Le The Tuyen (2018), "*State budget expenditure on vocational education and training in Vietnam - Practice and Recommendations*", Workshop proceedings "Scientific and practical base to evaluate effectiveness and efficiency of state budget spending on education", Academy of Finance, Co-author.
8. Le The Tuyen (2019), "*Global financial management mechanism for public administration units and lesson for Vietnam*", Financial Journal, Issue 1 - March 2019 (700), page 164-168, Author.
9. Le The Tuyen (2019), "*Views and principles to improve the financial management mechanism for public higher education*", Journal of Financial and Accounting Study, Vol. 05 (190), page 39-42, Author.
10. Le The Tuyen (2019), "*Financial management mechanism for public higher education - Practice and Solutions*", Journal of Financial and Accounting Study, Vol. 06 (191), page 17-23, Author.